

**CITY OF MINNEAPOLIS
CPED PLANNING DIVISION
HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION STAFF REPORT**

FILE NAME: 4501 East Lake Harriet Parkway

CATEGORY/DISTRICT: Historic Resource

CLASSIFICATION: Nomination for Consideration for Designation as a Local Historic Landmark

APPLICANT: City of Minneapolis Community Planning and Economic Development

DATE OF APPLICATION: July 10, 2008

PUBLICATION DATE: July 22, 2008

DATE OF HEARING: July 29, 2008

APPEAL PERIOD EXPIRATION: August 8, 2008

STAFF INVESTIGATION AND REPORT: Brian Schaffer (612) 673-2670

A. BACKGROUND

The property located at 4501 East Lake Harriet Parkway was constructed in 1924 by C.F. Haglin & Sons and designed by architect Frederick Mann. The single family home was constructed for Charles F. Haglin, Jr. the son of Charles F. Haglin who founded C.F. Haglin & Sons Company, a construction company that built The Grain Exchange, Minneapolis's City Hall and numerous other properties in Minneapolis, Minnesota and the United States.

The historical integrity of the subject property is currently endangered as the owners intend to construct a new structure on the site using a portion of the foundation and exterior walls. On October 29, 2007 a wrecking permit to demolish the subject property was applied for. On November 8, 2007 staff notified the property owners that the property was an historic resource and would require a public hearing by the HPC for a demolition of an historic resource. On May 21, 2008 a site plan review application for a new single family dwelling was submitted to CPED-Planning Staff. The plans for the new home show a new home constructed on the site, which incorporates a portion of the existing foundation and exterior walls. On June 6, 2008 the administrative site plan review application for the new single family home was deemed complete and on June 25, 2008 the administrative site plan review application for a new single family home was approved by CPED-Planning. As of the date of publication for this report a building permit application for the subject property has not been submitted. Attachments 7 though 12 are the correspondence with the applicants regarding the proposed single family dwelling.

Section 599.460 of the Minneapolis Code of Ordinances grants staff power to review wrecking permit applications to determine whether the affected property is an historic resource and would required an application for the Demolition of an Historic Resource and HPC review and approval. State Building Code requires that local jurisdictions, such as Minneapolis, issue construction permits. The City of Minneapolis has the discretion to require various types of construction permits including remodeling permits (BIRE), permits for new construction (BINB) and permits

for wrecking and moving (BWM). The proposed single family will likely not require a wrecking permit for the existing structure. Since a wrecking permit has not been required an application of the Demolition of an Historic Resource cannot be required based on the submitted applications.

B. PHYSICAL DESCRIPTION AND CONDITION OF THE PROPERTY

4501 East Lake Harriet Parkway is constructed of stucco and brick in a revival style that is suggestive of the symmetry of the Georgian style. The windows are a 12 light casement window with a brick surround. The second story windows of the front façade project above the roof line creating a barreled vault. The second story windows on the rear façade also project above the roof line, but lack that barrel vault detail found on the front façade. The slate covered hip roof is interrupted by a centered front dormer and a non-original rear shed dormer. The exterior stucco and brick are currently painted in a pale mint green and the brick window surrounds and trim details are painted white. The original colors of the brick and stucco are unknown.

The structure has seen a few modifications since it was originally built in 1924. Most notable is from 1953; a two story, 20 feet 6 inch by 16 feet 4 inch addition was built on the south side of the existing dwelling. The addition included many of details found on the exterior of the original home including the brick window surrounds and the barrel vaulted second story window. Historic building permit information is sparse for this structure, but staff believes that that the rear first story sunroom and rear dormer are likely not original. Despite the additions and the paint staff believes the structure exhibits a high degree of historical and physical integrity.

C. HISTORICAL CONTEXT OF THE PROPERTY

Frederick Mann (1868-1959) was born in New York in 1868. He later moved to Minneapolis where he attended high school and later graduated from the University of Minnesota in 1892 with a degree in civil engineering. He then entered the Massachusetts Institute of Technology and earned a bachelors degree in Architecture in 1894 and master's degree in architecture in 1895. He was an instructor at the University of Pennsylvania from 1896 to 1901. He then founded the architecture school at Washington University in St. Louis, Missouri and served as Professor of Architecture from 1902 to 1910. In 1910 Frederick Mann became the head of the Department of Architecture at the University of Illinois and remained there for three years before founding the University of Minnesota's School of Architecture in 1913.

In addition to his architecture and education career, Mr. Mann was a member of the Minneapolis Planning Commission from 1927 to 1936 and its president in 1927 and 1931. He was elected a fellow of the American Institute of Architects (AIA) and was a member of the American Civil Engineering Association, the National Economic League, and the Minneapolis Engineers Club. He was among the dozen founders of the Association of Collegiate Schools of Architecture and also a founder of the Small House bureau, an organization that developed low-cost plans for small homes¹.

He received the first award for achievement offered by the Minnesota society of the AIA and the first two medals offered by the Beaux Arts Architects for his works. He also received an AIA gold

¹ "F.M. Mann, Former City Architect, Dies" Minneapolis Tribune, October 29, 1959

medal in a 1920s national competition for the best dwelling in the \$75,000 class for the J.K. Shaw house at 4861 East Lake Harriet Parkway.²

While serving as the head of the University of Minnesota's School of Architecture he continued with commissions and the development of numerous plans. Between 1914 and 1925 Frederick Mann served as chief designer for the architecture firm of McEnary and Krafft. The projects he designed during this time likely come from the firm of McEnary and Krafft, this includes the subject property at 4501 East Lake Harriet Parkway.

Commissions:

- University Methodist Church in Austin, Texas. – 1907
- University YMCA (Austin, Texas) - 1910
- University YMCA (Minneapolis)– 1922
- University of Minnesota Memorial Stadium – 1924
- St. Louis Public Library
- St. Louis Masonic Temple
- The Church of St. John the Evangelist in Philadelphia

Other Noteworthy Projects in Minneapolis (All Extant):

- 329 10th Avenue Southeast – Kappa Kappa Gamma Sorority - 1915
- 1717 University Avenue Southeast- Delta Tau Delta Fraternity - 1921
- 315 19th Avenue Southeast – Alpha Rho Chi Fraternity – 1926
- 2364 West Lake of the Isles Parkway – Arthur D. Hirschfelder House - 1916
- 2280 West Lake of the Isles Parkway – Dr. Louis A Nippert House – 1922
- 1120 Mount Curve Avenue – C.F. Haglin House - 1923
- 1418 Mount Curve Ave – Dr. Charles A. Reed House – 1923
- 4247 Linden Hills Boulevard- George W. Parker House - 1924
- 4861 East Lake Harriet Parkway- J.K. Shaw House – 1926

Besides being designed by the by Frederick Mann the property at 4501 East Lake Harriet Parkway is located in a potential historic district that was identified in the 2005 Southwest Minneapolis Historic Resources Inventory.

Lynnhurst Potential Residential Historic District

This concentration of homes is located along the southwestern shores of Lake Harriet and is associated with the development of the Lynnhurst Addition of the city plat. The area identified is bounded by 42nd Street West on the north; 48th Street West on the south; Dupont Avenue South on the east; and Lake Harriet Boulevard East on the west. This area includes an additional two-block area south of the Lynnhurst Addition. The area was delineated to include homes that display comparable architectural styles, form, massing, and character with comparable lot sizes and set backs that provide a consistent setting.

Originally labeled the “Colony,” the area was owned by the local firm Loring and Brown in the late-nineteenth century. In an effort to promote residential development near the lakes, the firm offered to give away lots along the current Fremont Avenue South with the condition that the new residents construct homes costing at least \$3,000. In 1893, nine prominent families, including E.W. Decker,

² “Frederick Mann Dies in California” Minneapolis Star, October 29, 195

Maude Armatage, James McClanahan, Douglas Lansing, John Rickel, Frank C. Metcalf, George Tuttle, Douglas Fiske, and John Baxter, moved to the 4600-block of Fremont Avenue South. The families remained isolated for more than a decade during which time local history indicates the area acquired the name “Lynnhurst” due to the abundance of linden trees.

In 1903, the Lynnhurst Addition was platted by Clinton Morrison and was developed by David C. Bell. The addition was comprised of a tract of land bounded on the north by 42nd Street West; 46th Street West on the south; Dupont Avenue South on the east; and the shores of Lake Harriet on the west. The wide tree-lined boulevard along Dupont Avenue South and 46th Street West was renamed King’s Highway and adds character to the Lynnhurst area. Subsequent neighborhood development attracted wealthy citizens of Minneapolis that included bankers and city officials.

The Lynnhurst Potential Residential Historic District appears to be a good candidate for local landmark designation, under *Criterion 5* as a significant pattern of development and under *Criterion 4* for architecture, and/or for the National Register under *Criterion A: Community Planning and Development* and *Criterion C: Architecture*.

The property at 4501 East Lake Harriet Parkway also borders the East Lake Harriet Parkway, which is part of the Grand Rounds. The public property of the Grand Rounds is subject of a National Register of Historic Places Designation.

D. CONSIDERATION FOR NOMINATION

Per section 599.230 the Heritage Preservation Commission shall review all complete nomination applications, if the HPC determines that a nominated property appears to meet at least one of the local designation criteria the commission may direct the planning director to commence a designation study of the property.

Staff believes the property has significance under local designation criterion number 6 for being designed by Frederick Mann and potentially under criterion number 2 for being the residence of Charles F. Haglin Jr. a prominent developer in Minneapolis.

(6) The property exemplifies works of master builders, engineers, designers, artists, craftsmen or architects.

Frederick Mann may not have won an award for the design of 4501 East Lake Harriet Parkway like he did for the J.K. Shaw house at 4861 East Lake Harriet Parkway. However, the property exemplifies Mann’s take on a revival style structure. The structure is rich in details from the decorative posts of the front vestibule to the barrel vaulted second story windows that project into the roof line. It is part of the body of Mann’s work that illustrates his progression and versatility as an architect.

(2) The property is associated with the lives of significant persons or groups

The structure at 4501 East Lake Harriet Parkway was constructed by C.F. Haglin and Sons for Charles F. Haglin Jr., the son of Charles Haglin who founded the company. After he graduated from the Massachusetts Institute of Technology in 1913 he went to work with his father’s company. This is when C.F. Haglin and Sons was created. Charles Haglin Jr lived in the structure

on 4501 East Lake Harriet Parkway from 1924 through 1946³, when he and his wife moved to Wayzata. Under Haglin Jr. the C.F. Haglin and Sons built numerous structures including the Cream of Wheat Building at 730 Stinson Parkway.

E. APPLICABLE ORDINANCES:

Chapter 599. Heritage Preservation Regulation

F. ARTICLE V. DESIGNATION

599.200. Purpose. This article is established to promote the preservation of historic resources by providing the commission with authority to recommend the designation of landmarks and historic districts and to adopt design guidelines for designated properties.

599.210. Designation criteria. The following criteria shall be considered in determining whether a property is worthy of designation as a landmark or historic district because of its historical, cultural, architectural, archaeological or engineering significance:

- (1) The property is associated with significant events or with periods that exemplify broad patterns of cultural, political, economic or social history.
- (2) The property is associated with the lives of significant persons or groups.
- (3) The property contains or is associated with distinctive elements of city identity.
- (4) The property embodies the distinctive characteristics of an architectural or engineering type or style, or method of construction.
- (5) The property exemplifies a landscape design or development pattern distinguished by innovation, rarity, uniqueness or quality of design or detail.
- (6) The property exemplifies works of master builders, engineers, designers, artists, craftsmen or architects.
- (7) The property has yielded, or may be likely to yield, information important in prehistory or history.

599.220. Nomination of property. Nomination of a property to be considered for designation as a landmark or historic district shall be submitted to the planning director on a nomination application form approved by the planning director and shall be accompanied by all required supporting information. A nomination may be made by any of the following:

- (1) A member of the heritage preservation commission.
- (2) A member of the city council.
- (3) The mayor.
- (4) The planning director.
- (5) Any person with a legal or equitable interest in the subject property.

599.230. Commission decision on nomination. The commission shall review all complete nomination applications. If the commission determines that a nominated property appears to meet at least one of the criteria for designation contained in section 599.210, the commission may direct the planning director to commence a designation study of the property.

³ Minneapolis City Directories 1924-1947

599.240. Interim protection. (a) Purpose. Interim protection is established to protect a nominated property from destruction or inappropriate alteration during the designation process.

(b) Effective date. Interim protection shall be in effect from the date of the commission's decision to commence a designation study of a nominated property until the city council makes a decision regarding the designation of the property, or for twelve (12) months, whichever comes first. Interim protection may be extended for such additional periods as the commission may deem appropriate and necessary to protect the designation process, not exceeding a total additional period of eighteen (18) months. The commission shall hold a public hearing on a proposed extension of interim protection as provided in section 599.170.

(c) Scope of restrictions. During the interim protection period, no alteration or minor alteration of a nominated property shall be allowed except where authorized by a certificate of appropriateness or a certificate of no change, as provided in this chapter.

599.250. State historic preservation office review. The planning director shall submit all proposed designations to the state historic preservation officer for review and comment within sixty (60) days.

599.260. City planning commission review. The planning director shall submit all proposed designations to the city planning commission for review and comment on the proposal within thirty (30) days. In its review, the city planning commission shall consider but not be limited to the following factors:

- (1) The relationship of the proposed designation to the city's comprehensive plan.
- (2) The effect of the proposed designation on the surrounding area.
- (3) The consistency of the proposed designation with applicable development plans or development objectives adopted by the city council.

599.270. Designation hearing. Following completion of the designation study the commission shall hold a public hearing to consider the proposed designation, as provided in section 599.170. Any person having a legal or equitable interest in a nominated property shall be allowed reasonable opportunity to give testimony or present evidence concerning the proposed designation.

599.280. Commission recommendation. Following the public hearing, the commission shall make findings with respect to the proposed designation and shall submit the same together with its recommendation to the zoning and planning committee of the city council. In making its findings and recommendation, the commission shall consider the designation criteria contained in section 599.210, the information contained in the designation study, the state historic preservation officer's comments, the city planning commission's comments, the planning director's report and all testimony and evidence received at the public hearing relating to the designation.

G. FINDINGS:

1. 4501 East Lake Harriet Parkway was designed by Frederick Mann and built in 1924 for Charles F. Haglin Jr. of C.F. Haglin and Sons.
2. Staff believes the property has significance under local designation criterion number 6 “the property exemplifies works of master builders, engineers, designers, artists, craftsmen or architects” for being designed by Frederick Mann.
3. Staff believes the property may have significance under local designation criterion number 2 “the property is associated with the lives of significant persons or group” for being the residence of Charles F. Haglin Jr.
4. Frederick Mann founded the architecture schools of the University of Minnesota and Washington University. He was a fellow of the American Institute of Architects and has won numerous awards for his designs.
5. The structure at 4501 East Lake Harriet Parkway exemplifies the wide body of Fredrick Mann’s work, which included private residences, stadiums and numerous public buildings.
6. The property at 4501 East Lake Harriet Parkway may be a contributing structure to a possible Lynnhurst Residential Historic District.

H. STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommends that the Heritage Preservation Commission adopt staff findings and **direct** the Planning Director to commence a designation study of 4501 East Lake Harriet Parkway.

ATTACHMENTS

1. Map of the Area
2. Building Permits for the Subject Property
3. Current Pictures of the Subject Property
4. Map of Lynnhurst Potential Residential Historic District
5. Map of Locally Designated Districts and Landmarks
6. Map of Historic Survey Areas and Potential Historic Districts
7. November 8, 2007 Letter to Charlie Ainsworth from Brian Schaffer RE: Demolition Application
8. May 28, 2008 Letter to Petra Schwartz RE: Administrative Site Plan Review Application for new home
9. June 2, 2008 Letter to Jack Byers from Carol Lansing in response to May 28, 2008 letter
10. June 3, 2008 Letter to Mr. and Mrs Simpson from Amy Lucas RE: historic status of 4501 East Lake Harriet Parkway
11. June 6, 2008 Letter to Carol Lansing from Jack Byers deeming the Administrative Site Plan Review Application complete
12. June 25, 2008 Letter to Petra Schwartz from Brian Schaffer approving the Administrative Site Plan Review Application